

A Guide to Refugee Law in Australia

Migration and Refugee Division
Legal Services

Administrative Appeals Tribunal

Disclaimer: This Guide was prepared by the Migration and Refugee Division Legal Services Section of the Administrative Appeals Tribunal, for use by members and staff. It is provided for general information only. It is not intended as a legal textbook or a substitute for advice and should not be treated as such. No warranty is given in relation to the accuracy, currency or completeness of the Guide. The Commonwealth Government, its employees, officers or agents accept no responsibility for any loss or damage, whether direct or indirect, arising from use of, or reliance on, material contained in the Guide. The material in this Guide may include the views of third parties, but do not necessarily reflect the views of the Tribunal or of the Commonwealth Government.

© Commonwealth of Australia 2019

This Guide is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia licence. The details of the relevant licence conditions are available on the Creative Commons website, as is the full legal code: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/au/>. Material obtained from this Guide is to be attributed to the tribunal as:

Source: Administrative Appeals Tribunal, 'A Guide to Refugee Law in Australia'

All enquiries concerning this licence should be addressed to: Copyright Officer, Administrative Appeals Tribunal, GPO Box 9955, Sydney NSW 2001; or email: enquiries@aat.gov.au.

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

CHAPTER 1: PROTECTION VISAS

THE STATUTORY CONTEXT	1-1
THE PROTECTION VISA SCHEME	1-2
REQUIREMENTS FOR A VALID PROTECTION VISA APPLICATION	1-5
Unauthorised maritime arrivals and transitory persons.....	1-5
Previous refusal of protection visa	1-6
Comprehensive Plan of Action and safe third countries	1-9
Temporary safe haven visa	1-10
Protection of third countries	1-10
Application form and other Schedule 1 requirements.....	1-11
CONVERSION OF PERMANENT TO TEMPORARY PROTECTION VISA APPLICATIONS.....	1-13
CRITERIA FOR GRANT OF A PROTECTION VISA	1-14
Section 36 criteria	1-14
Schedule 2 criteria	1-15
CIRCUMSTANCES IN WHICH PROTECTION VISA MUST BE REFUSED	1-19
Identity, nationality or citizenship documentation	1-20
Applications made by family members of protection visa holders	1-23
PERSONS IN RESPECT OF WHOM AUSTRALIA HAS PROTECTION OBLIGATIONS.....	1-23
PROTECTION OBLIGATIONS AS A REFUGEE	1-23
Protection obligations under the Refugees Convention (pre 16 December 2014).....	1-24
Protection obligations as a statutory refugee (post 16 December 2014)	1-26
PROTECTION OBLIGATIONS ON COMPLEMENTARY PROTECTION GROUNDS.....	1-27
The statutory qualifications: sections 36(2B) and 36(2C)	1-27
COMMON STATUTORY QUALIFICATIONS: s.36(3).....	1-28
INTERPRETATIVE PRINCIPLES	1-29
INTERPRETING INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS	1-30

CHAPTER 2: COUNTRY OF REFERENCE

INTRODUCTION.....	2-1
COUNTRY OF REFERENCE – THE REFUGEES CONVENTION	2-2
COUNTRY OF REFERENCE UNDER THE MIGRATION ACT	2-3
RECEIVING COUNTRY – REFUGEE AND COMPLEMENTARY PROTECTION CRITERIA POST 16 DECEMBER 2014	2-4
RECEIVING COUNTRY – COMPLEMENTARY PROTECTION CRITERION PRE 16 DECEMBER 2014	2-4
DETERMINING THE COUNTRY OF REFERENCE.....	2-5

WHAT IS A 'COUNTRY'?	2-6
COUNTRY OF NATIONALITY	2-7
What is nationality?	2-8
The factual assessment of nationality	2-10
Dual or multiple nationality	2-12
STATELESSNESS AND COUNTRY OF FORMER HABITUAL RESIDENCE	2-15
Identifying the country of former habitual residence	2-15
More than one country of former habitual residence?	2-17
Where an applicant has no right of return	2-18
OTHER ISSUES	2-21
Where applicant is a national of a country and former resident of a second country	2-21
Where family members are of different nationalities	2-22
Children born in Australia	2-23
Refusal of country to accept return of citizen	2-24

CHAPTER 3: WELL FOUNDED FEAR

INTRODUCTION	3-2
'WELL-FOUNDED FEAR' UNDER THE REFUGEES CONVENTION	3-2
THE SUBJECTIVE ELEMENT	3-3
THE OBJECTIVE ELEMENT	3-4
The 'real chance' test	3-4
What is 'a real chance'?	3-5
'Unlikely' is not the correct test	3-5
No comparatively higher risk	3-6
'Well-founded' means something more than plausible	3-6
Mere speculation cannot establish a 'well-founded fear'	3-6
The relevant time for determination	3-6
Assessment of a real chance of persecution	3-7
Reasonably foreseeable future	3-7
The role of past events in establishing a 'well-founded fear'	3-8
Cumulative effect of past experiences	3-9
'What if I am wrong?'	3-10
'Benefit of the doubt'	3-12
What remains if an applicant is affirmatively disbelieved?	3-13
Consideration of general information about country conditions	3-13
WELL-FOUNDED FEAR AND STATE PROTECTION	3-15
REFUGEES 'SUR PLACE'	3-15
Becoming a refugee sur place through voluntary actions	3-16
What is the effect of actions taken in bad faith? – Section 91R(3)	3-16
What is conduct?	3-18
Whose conduct is relevant?	3-19
Purpose of the conduct	3-20
When must the conduct be disregarded?	3-21
CONCLUSIONS	3-22
'WELL-FOUNDED FEAR' UNDER SECTION 5J OF THE ACT	3-22
A FEAR OF BEING PERSECUTED	3-23

FOR REASONS OF RACE, RELIGION, NATIONALITY, MEMBERSHIP OF A PARTICULAR SOCIAL GROUP OR POLITICAL OPINION.....	3-23
A REAL CHANCE OF PERSECUTION	3-24
THE REAL CHANCE OF PERSECUTION MUST RELATE TO ALL AREAS OF THE RECEIVING COUNTRY.....	3-24
Whether the real chance of persecution is localised	3-25
Considerations of access and safety	3-26
AVAILABILITY OF EFFECTIVE PROTECTION MEASURES	3-27
MODIFICATION OF BEHAVIOUR SO AS TO AVOID A REAL CHANCE OF PERSECUTION.....	3-27
Modifications that cannot be required	3-29
Modification conflicting with a characteristic fundamental to identity or conscience.....	3-30
Modification requiring an applicant to conceal an innate or immutable characteristic.....	3-31
Modification of a specified type.....	3-31
THE CONCEPT OF PERSECUTION.....	3-32
CONDUCT ENGAGED IN FOR THE PURPOSE OF STRENGTHENING THE APPLICATION.....	3-32

CHAPTER 4: PERSECUTION

INTRODUCTION.....	4-1
SERIOUS HARM.....	4-4
THE RELEVANCE OF AN APPLICANT’S PERSONAL ATTRIBUTES.....	4-10
SYSTEMATIC AND DISCRIMINATORY CONDUCT	4-11
‘SYSTEMATIC...’	4-11
‘...AND DISCRIMINATORY’	4-13
OTHER ISSUES.....	4-14
AGENTS OF PERSECUTION.....	4-15
LAWS AND LAW ENFORCEMENT.....	4-16
DISCRIMINATORY FAILURE OF STATE PROTECTION AS PERSECUTION.....	4-17
PERSECUTION ON CUMULATIVE GROUNDS	4-20

CHAPTER 5: REFUGEE GROUNDS AND NEXUS

INTRODUCTION.....	5-1
‘FOR REASONS OF...’.....	5-2
CAUSAL CONNECTION BETWEEN THE HARM FEARED AND A REFUGEE GROUND	5-2
THE MOTIVATIONAL REQUIREMENT	5-4
IMPUTED ATTRIBUTE SUFFICIENT TO ESTABLISH NEXUS.....	5-5
MOTIVATION OF THE APPLICANT INSUFFICIENT	5-6
FOCUS ON THE PERSECUTOR’S MOTIVATION	5-7
REFUGEE GROUND MUST BE THE ESSENTIAL AND SIGNIFICANT REASON OR REASONS	5-8
THE REFUGEE GROUNDS	5-10
RACE.....	5-11
RELIGION	5-12
Definition of ‘religion’	5-12
Persecution ‘for reasons of’ religion.....	5-14
NATIONALITY	5-16

MEMBERSHIP OF A PARTICULAR SOCIAL GROUP	5-17
'Particular social group' under the Refugees Convention	5-18
Characteristics of a particular social group.....	5-19
What is not required.....	5-25
The 'is/does' distinction.....	5-26
Identifying particular social groups.....	5-28
Examples of particular social groups	5-29
'Particular social group' under s.5L of the Act.....	5-36
A characteristic shared by each member of the group	5-37
A characteristic of a specified type	5-37
A characteristic that is not a fear of persecution.....	5-39
A characteristic that the applicant shares, or is perceived as sharing	5-39
Membership of a family as a particular social group.....	5-40
'For reasons of...membership'	5-42
POLITICAL OPINION	5-43
'For reasons of...political opinion'	5-46
FACT-FINDING – TESTING AN APPLICANT’S KNOWLEDGE.....	5-48

CHAPTER 6: RELOCATION

INTRODUCTION.....	6-1
THE RELOCATION PRINCIPLE.....	6-2
TEXTUAL FOUNDATION	6-3
WHEN DOES THE ISSUE OF RELOCATION ARISE?	6-4
APPLYING THE RELOCATION TEST	6-6
WHETHER THE FEARED PERSECUTION IS LOCALISED	6-7
Behaving 'discreetly' to avoid persecution	6-9
WHETHER RELOCATION IS REASONABLE IN ALL THE CIRCUMSTANCES.....	6-10
Should or would reasonably relocate?	6-11
Factors relevant to reasonableness of relocation	6-12
SPECIFICALLY IDENTIFYING AN AREA TO WHICH THE APPLICANT CAN RELOCATE.....	6-20
CONSIDERATION OF RELOCATION AS A PRELIMINARY ISSUE	6-21

CHAPTER 7: EXCLUSION AND CESSATION

INTRODUCTION.....	7-2
EXCLUSION AND CESSATION IN RELATION TO REFUGEE STATUS.....	7-3
Protection visa applications made prior to 16 December 2014.....	7-3
Protection visa applications made on or after 16 December 2014	7-4
EXCLUSION FROM COMPLEMENTARY PROTECTION.....	7-5
SECURITY RISK CRITERIA FOR THE GRANT OF A PROTECTION VISA	7-5
Adverse ASIO assessment – s.36(1B)	7-6
Danger to security or the community – s.36(1C)	7-6
JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES.....	7-7
ARTICLE 1C.....	7-7

CIRCUMSTANCES IN WHICH ARTICLE 1C ISSUES MAY ARISE FOR CONSIDERATION	7-9
CHANGES IN PERSONAL CIRCUMSTANCES – ARTICLE 1C(1) - (4)	7-10
Article 1C(1) – Voluntary re-availment of the protection of country of nationality	7-10
Article 1C(2) - Voluntary re-acquisition of nationality	7-12
Article 1C(3) - Acquisition of new nationality	7-12
Article 1C(4) - Voluntary re-establishment in the country where persecution was feared	7-13
CHANGES IN COUNTRY CIRCUMSTANCES - ARTICLE 1C(5) AND (6)	7-14
The provisos	7-15
ARTICLE 1D.....	7-16
HISTORICAL BACKGROUND TO ARTICLE 1D AND RELEVANT UN AGENCIES	7-17
EXCLUSION UNDER ARTICLE 1D	7-19
Persons who are at present receiving protection or assistance – the first paragraph	7-19
Persons.....	7-19
At present.....	7-19
Receiving	7-19
Protection or assistance	7-20
Summary of first paragraph of Article 1D.....	7-20
Cessation of protection or assistance – the second paragraph.....	7-20
Protection or assistance has ceased for any reason	7-20
‘ <i>Ipso facto</i> entitled to the benefits of the Convention’	7-21
Whether protection or assistance has ceased: Factual issues	7-21
Summary: the application of Article 1D under Australian law	7-24
ARTICLE 1E	7-24
THE APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 1E	7-25
‘TAKEN RESIDENCE’	7-25
RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS OF A NATIONAL	7-25
Recourse to protection	7-26
ARTICLE 1F	7-27
SERIOUS REASONS FOR CONSIDERING	7-28
CRIMES AGAINST PEACE, WAR CRIMES, CRIMES AGAINST HUMANITY	7-30
Definition of crimes against peace, war crimes and crimes against humanity.....	7-31
Crimes against peace	7-33
War crimes	7-34
Crimes against humanity	7-35
Defences.....	7-37
SERIOUS NON-POLITICAL CRIMES.....	7-38
The elements of Article 1F(b).....	7-39
‘Crime’	7-39
‘Serious’	7-40
Seriousness of crimes versus possible harm feared.....	7-42
Meaning of ‘non-political crime’.....	7-42
‘Committed ... outside the country of refuge’.....	7-45
The significance of prior punishment for the crime	7-46
ACTS CONTRARY TO THE PURPOSES AND PRINCIPLES OF THE UN	7-46
ARTICLES 32 AND 33(2).....	7-50
ARTICLE 32.....	7-51
ARTICLE 33.....	7-51

Reasonable grounds	7-52
Meaning of ‘danger to the security of the country’	7-52
Meaning of ‘particularly serious crime’	7-53
Danger to the community	7-54

CHAPTER 8: STATE PROTECTION

INTRODUCTION.....	8-1
STATE PROTECTION UNDER THE REFUGEES CONVENTION	8-2
‘THE PROTECTION OF THAT COUNTRY’ = EXTERNAL PROTECTION.....	8-3
Unable or unwilling	8-4
INTERNAL PROTECTION	8-5
Well-founded fear	8-6
Persecution	8-7
Unable or unwilling	8-8
Adequacy of protection	8-9
Whether circumstances establish lack of protection.....	8-13
No legal presumption of State protection	8-14
Protection from non-government agencies	8-15
PROTECTION AND STATELESSNESS	8-16
NO FUNCTIONING STATE APPARATUS – ‘PROTECTION’ VS ‘ACCOUNTABILITY’	8-16
PROTECTION UNDER SECTION 5H OF THE ACT.....	8-19
UNABLE OR UNWILLING TO AVAIL THEMSELVES OF PROTECTION OF THE COUNTRY.....	8-20
EFFECTIVE PROTECTION MEASURES	8-21
Protection by a State, party or organisation	8-22
Willing and able to provide protection	8-23
Circumstances where the State, party or organisation is taken to be able to offer protection	8-23

CHAPTER 9: THIRD COUNTRY PROTECTION

INTRODUCTION.....	9-1
THE STATUTORY QUALIFICATION TO ‘PROTECTION OBLIGATIONS’.....	9-2
RIGHT TO ENTER AND RESIDE, WHETHER TEMPORARILY OR PERMANENTLY	9-4
‘Right’ means a lawfully given liberty, permission or privilege.....	9-5
‘Right’ means a presently existing right.....	9-6
Right to enter and reside	9-7
Whether temporarily or permanently.....	9-10
‘However that right arose or is expressed’	9-11
ALL POSSIBLE STEPS.....	9-12
APPLYING SECTION 36(3) – SOME SCENARIOS.....	9-13
THE QUALIFICATIONS TO SECTION 36(3).....	9-15
Sections 36(4)(a) and (5) – well-founded fear of being persecuted.....	9-16
Sections 36(4)(b) and (5A) - real risk of significant harm	9-17

CHAPTER 10: COMPLEMENTARY PROTECTION

INTRODUCTION.....	10-2
ADDRESSING CLAIMS UNDER SECTION 36(2)(AA).....	10-3
RECEIVING COUNTRY.....	10-5
ASSESSING THE RISK OF HARM	10-5
REAL RISK	10-6
SUBSTANTIAL GROUNDS FOR BELIEVING	10-7
A NECESSARY AND FORESEEABLE CONSEQUENCE	10-8
SUR PLACE CLAIMS	10-9
MODIFIED CONDUCT TO AVOID THREAT OF HARM	10-9
SIGNIFICANT HARM.....	10-11
ARBITRARY DEPRIVATION OF LIFE.....	10-13
THE DEATH PENALTY WILL BE CARRIED OUT	10-15
TORTURE	10-16
An act or omission	10-17
Severe pain or suffering, whether physical or mental	10-17
Intentionally inflicted.....	10-17
Purpose.....	10-18
CRUEL OR INHUMAN TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT.....	10-20
An act or omission	10-21
(Severe) pain or suffering	10-22
An act or omission which ... could reasonably be regarded as cruel or inhuman in nature ..	10-22
Intention	10-23
Act or omission not inconsistent with Article 7	10-23
DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT	10-24
An act or omission	10-24
Extreme humiliation which is unreasonable.....	10-25
Intention	10-26
Act or omission not inconsistent with Article 7	10-26
LAWFUL SANCTIONS.....	10-26
PERPETRATOR OF THE HARM.....	10-28
Self harm or harm resulting from actions of others.....	10-28
Harm caused by removing the applicant from Australia	10-28
CIRCUMSTANCES IN WHICH THERE IS TAKEN NOT TO BE A REAL RISK	10-30
RELOCATION	10-31
PROTECTION FROM AN AUTHORITY.....	10-32
A RISK FACED BY THE POPULATION GENERALLY.....	10-34
PROTECTION OF A THIRD COUNTRY	10-35
INELIGIBILITY FOR GRANT OF A PROTECTION VISA.....	10-36
CRIMES AGAINST PEACE, WAR CRIMES, CRIMES AGAINST HUMANITY, SERIOUS NON-POLITICAL CRIMES AND ACTS CONTRARY TO THE PURPOSES AND PRINCIPLES OF THE UN.....	10-36
DANGER TO THE AUSTRALIAN COMMUNITY.....	10-37

CHAPTER 11: APPLICATION OF THE REFUGEES CONVENTION IN PARTICULAR SITUATIONS

INTRODUCTION.....	11-1
FAILURE TO ADHERE TO BASIC STANDARDS OF HUMAN RIGHTS	11-2
CIVIL DISTURBANCES	11-3
LAWS AND LAW ENFORCEMENT.....	11-4
LAWS OF GENERAL APPLICATION.....	11-5
Selective enforcement of a law of general application	11-8
General laws that impact adversely on a particular group	11-9
The legitimacy threshold	11-11
Discriminatory laws that are not enforced	11-13
DETENTION AND MISTREATMENT IN DETENTION	11-14
CONSCRIPTION LAWS.....	11-15
‘VALUE-LADEN’ LAWS	11-23
POSITIVE DISCRIMINATION	11-24
DENIAL OF THE RIGHT TO RETURN / EXPULSION	11-25
SELF EXPRESSION AND SUPPRESSION OF OPINIONS, BELIEFS AND IDENTITY	11-26
MODIFICATION OF CONDUCT NOT ARISING FROM A CONVENTION-PROTECTED ATTRIBUTE.....	11-29
CLAIMS ARISING FROM PERSONAL AND FAMILY RELATIONSHIPS.....	11-32
FAMILIAL REJECTION AND FAMILIAL PRESSURE TO MARRY	11-33
VIOLENCE ARISING FROM PERSONAL RELATIONSHIPS	11-34
CRIMINAL CONDUCT	11-36
REVENGE	11-36
EXTORTION	11-38
HARM RESULTING FROM EXPOSING CORRUPTION	11-40
LAND DISPOSSESSION	11-42
VULNERABILITY	11-43

CHAPTER 12: MERITS REVIEW OF PROTECTION VISA DECISIONS

INTRODUCTION.....	12-1
THE AAT’S JURISDICTION.....	12-2
WHICH DECISIONS CAN BE REVIEWED?	12-2
WHO CAN APPLY FOR REVIEW?	12-3
WHICH DIVISION ARE THEY REVIEWED IN?	12-3
LIMITATIONS ON SCOPE OF MRD REVIEW	12-3
THE IAA’S JURISDICTION – ‘FAST-TRACK’ DECISIONS.....	12-4
SPECIAL PROVISIONS FOR REVIEWS IN THE MIGRATION AND REFUGEE DIVISION	12-5
EFFECT OF EARLIER REVIEW.....	12-5
OBLIGATIONS ON AN APPLICANT IN MAKING THEIR CASE	12-6
DEALING WITH NEW CLAIMS AND EVIDENCE	12-6

MINISTERIAL DIRECTIONS.....12-7