

AAT Bulletin

Issue No. 8/2023 24 April 2023

The *AAT Bulletin* is a fortnightly publication containing information about recently published decisions and appeals against decisions in the AAT’s General, Freedom of Information, National Disability Insurance Scheme, Security, Small Business Taxation, Taxation & Commercial and Veterans’ Appeals Divisions. The Bulletin also regularly includes a sample of decisions recently published in the AAT’s Migration & Refugee Division and Social Services & Child Support Division. It occasionally includes information on legislative changes that affect the AAT.

It is recommended that the Bulletin be read online. This has the advantage of allowing the reader to use hyperlinks to access the full text of cases and other internet sites mentioned in the Bulletin.

The AAT does not make any representation or warranty about the accuracy, reliability, currency or completeness of any material contained in this Bulletin or on any linked site. While the AAT makes every effort to ensure that the material in the Bulletin is accurate and up-to-date, you should exercise your own independent skill and judgement before you rely on it. Information contained in this Bulletin is not legal advice and is intended as a general guide only. You should rely on your own advice or refer to the full cases and legislation in relation to any proceedings.

Enquiries regarding this publication may be directed to **aatweb@aat.gov.au**.

Contents

[AAT Recent Decisions 3](#_Toc133226365)

[Child Support 3](#_Toc133226366)

[Compensation 4](#_Toc133226367)

[Health 4](#_Toc133226368)

[Immigration and Citizenship 4](#_Toc133226369)

[Migration 7](#_Toc133226370)

[National Disability Insurance Scheme 8](#_Toc133226371)

[Practice and Procedure 10](#_Toc133226372)

[Refugee 11](#_Toc133226373)

[Social Security 12](#_Toc133226374)

[Taxation 13](#_Toc133226375)

[Appeals 14](#_Toc133226376)

[Appeals lodged 14](#_Toc133226377)

[Appeals finalised 14](#_Toc133226378)

# AAT Recent Decisions

This section of the Bulletin provides information about all decisions recently published in the AAT’s General, Freedom of Information, National Disability Insurance Scheme, Security, Small Business Taxation, Taxation & Commercial and Veterans’ Appeals. This list also includes selected child support decisions published by the Social Services & Child Support Division and examples of recent decisions published by the Migration & Refugee Division. Only AAT decisions that have been published on [**AustLII**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/au/cases/cth/aat/) have been included. Full copies of the decisions can be accessed through the hyperlinks provided below.

### Child Support

[**NGWB and Child Support Registrar**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/807.html) (Child support second review) [2023] AATA 807 (19 April 2023); P Ranson, Member

CHILD SUPPORT – whether interim care period applies – where family court order regarding care of child in force – where parent refuses to help facilitate changeover – child refusing to participate in contact – whether reasonable action to ensure compliance with care arrangement was taken – commencement of an interim care period – decision under review varied

[Battley and Battley](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/850.html) (Child support) [2023] AATA 850 (8 March 2023); Y Webb, Member under review varied

[Downer and Downer](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/843.html) (Child support) [2023] AATA 843 (20 February 2023); M Baulch, Member

CHILD SUPPORT – non-agency payment – prescribed payment for school fees – payment credited – decision under review set aside and substituted

CHILD SUPPORT – non-agency payment – orthodontic costs – payment correctly credited – decision under review affirmed

[Guthrie and Benbrook](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/838.html) (Child support) [2023] AATA 838 (28 February 2023); M Douglas, Member

CHILD SUPPORT – percentage of care – what was the likely pattern of care from the start of the administrative assessment – decision under review set aside and substituted

[Marshall and Marshall](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/842.html) (Child support) [2023] AATA 842 (3 March 2023); P Jensen, Member

CHILD SUPPORT – percentage of care – whether child support case was correctly registered – decision under review affirmed

CHILD SUPPORT – departure determination – orthodontic costs – a ground for departure established – decision to depart – decision under review set aside and substituted

[Boyett and Fowler](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/848.html) (Child support) [2023] AATA 848 (13 March 2023); J Leonard, Member CHILD SUPPORT – opt-in arrears – whether there were unpaid amounts – decision

[**XQHZ and Child Support Registrar**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/770.html) (Child support second review) [2023] AATA 770 (14 April 2023); Senior Member K Millar

CHILD SUPPORT – percentage of care – change in percentage of care – whether percentage of care changed – criteria to determine to what extent a parent has care of a child – decision under review is set aside

### Compensation

[**Grima and K & S Freighters Pty Ltd**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/769.html) (Compensation) [2023] AATA 769 (17 April 2023); Senior Member Dr S Fenwick

COMPENSATION – rehabilitation – whether failure to undertake program without reasonable excuse – consideration of meaning of undertake – decisions affirmed

### Health

[**Inas Karem Holdings Pty Ltd and Secretary, Department of Health and Aged Care**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/754.html) [2023] AATA 754 (14 March 2023); Senior Member L Kirk

HEALTH LAW – cancellation of Applicant’s approval to supply pharmaceutical benefits – not carrying out business as a pharmacist at the approved premises – exercise of discretion to cancel under section 98(3) of the National Health Act 1953 (Cth) – decision under review affirmed

### Immigration and Citizenship

[**Alarcos and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/857.html) (Citizenship) [2023] AATA 857 (20 April 2023); Deputy President J Sosso

CITIZENSHIP – claim for citizenship by descent – constitutional history of Papua New Guinea – whether any of the exceptions in s 65 of the Papua New Guinea Constitution 1975 apply – whether Applicant’s great grandfather obtained and retained Filipino citizenship – decision under review affirmed

[**BNPB and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/730.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 730 (6 April 2023); Senior Member Dr M Evans-Bonner

MIGRATION – mandatory visa cancellation – decision of delegate of Minister not to revoke mandatory cancellation of the Applicant’s Visa – Cancellation Decision based on juvenile offending – whether a Cancellation Decision can be based on juvenile offending – whether the Tribunal has jurisdiction – whether the Applicant passes the character test – substantial criminal record – offences including aggravated home burglary and commit and aggravated armed robbery – Applicant is a 20-year-old citizen of Liberia who arrived in Australia when he was three years of age – Direction No 99 – primary and other considerations – protection of the Australian community – nature and seriousness of the conduct – risk to the Australian community – strength, nature and duration of ties to Australia – best interests of minor daughter and minor cousins – expectations of the Australian community – legal consequences of the decision – Australia’s international non-refoulement obligations – extent of impediments if removed – Reviewable Decision set aside and substituted

[**Ceitinn and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/736.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 736 (23 March 2023); Senior Member T Tavoularis

MIGRATION – Non-revocation of mandatory cancellation of a Partner (Class BS) (Subclass 801) visa – where Applicant does not pass the character test – whether there is another reason to revoke the mandatory cancellation decision – consideration of Ministerial Direction No. 99 – decision under review set aside and substituted

[**Edwards and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/764.html) (Citizenship) [2023] AATA 764 (14 April 2023); Senior Member A Nikolic AM CSC

CITIZENSHIP – application for conferral of Australian citizenship –– general residence requirement – nature of presence in Australia – decision affirmed

[**FYVY and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/790.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 790 (23 March 2023); Senior Member Dr N A Manetta

MIGRATION – refusal of protection visa on character grounds – substantial criminal record – Applicant owed protection obligations – whether to exercise statutory discretion to refuse visa – Direction 99 – seriousness of the applicant’s conduct – violent crime – family violence – frequent offending – cumulative effect of repeated offending – serious risk to the Australian community if applicant reoffends – childhood trauma – drug and alcohol dependence – strength, nature and duration of ties to Australia – legal consequences of decision – applicant cannot compulsorily be removed to country of origin – low likelihood that applicant will be removed to a third country – applicant has already spent five to six years in detention – prospect of continuing indefinite detention must be accorded considerable weight – WKMZ applied – decision under review set aside

[**Giri and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/841.html) (Citizenship) [2023] AATA 841 (21 April 2023); D Mitchell, Member

CITIZENSHIP – Australian Citizenship Act 2007 (Cth) – citizenship by conferral – where not a permanent resident for 12 months prior to making an application for citizenship – whether the discretions in section 22 apply – whether the Applicant meets the special residence requirements in section 22A or in section 22B – no discretion available – special residence requirements not met – decision under review affirmed

[**Mamaku and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/753.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 753 (12 April 2023); Deputy President The Hon. D Cowdroy AO KC

MIGRATION – mandatory visa cancellation – failure to pass the character test – whether there is another reason why the visa cancellation should be revoked – Ministerial Direction No. 99 – protection of the Australian community – nature and seriousness of offending conduct – risk of reoffending – best interests of minor children – strength, nature and duration of ties to Australia – expectations of the Australian community – impediments to removal – decision affirmed

[**Selamat and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/856.html) (Citizenship) [2023] AATA 856 (21 April 2022); Senior Member D J Morris

CITIZENSHIP – applicant applied for Australian citizenship by conferral – applicant satisfied certain requirements – delegate not satisfied applicant of good character – application therefore refused – applicant applied for review by Tribunal – criminal offending – minor traffic offences – domestic violence offence – good character must be assessed as at date of decision – applicant has discharged obligations to the Court – offences committed after citizenship application lodged – Tribunal finds more time must pass before being satisfied applicant of good character – decision under review is affirmed

[**Tausem and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/791.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 791 (2 March 2023); S Barton , Member

MIGRATION – decision of delegate of Minister to refuse to grant the Applicant a return visa – is the Tribunal satisfied that the Applicant passes the character test – Direction No 90 – Annex A – whether the Applicant would engage in the conduct identified in s 501(6)(d)(i) – – one recorded offence – domestic violence – Reviewable Decision set aside and substituted with a decision that the Applicant passes the character test

[**TRTZ and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/792.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 792 (6 April 2023); S Evans, Member

MIGRATION – Non-revocation of mandatory cancellation – Class TY Subclass 444 Special Category (Temporary) Visa – where the Applicant does not pass the character test by virtue of his “substantial criminal history” – whether there is “another reason” to revoke the mandatory cancellation – consideration of Ministerial Direction 99 – sexual offences against minor – interests of minor children who are not biologically related to Applicant - children without close family – decision under review set aside and substituted

[**XRGY and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/755.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 755 (13 April 2023); Deputy President S Boyle

MIGRATION – s 501(1) of the Migration Act 1958 – decision of a delegate of the Minister to refuse to grant the Applicant a Protection (Class XA) visa – whether the Applicant passes the character test under s 501(6)(c) – Ministerial Direction 99 – Application of character test – Applicant covered by previous protection finding – Applicant found not to pass the character test – whether Tribunal should exercise discretion in s 501(1) to refuse to grant the Applicant the visa – ASIO Adverse Security Assessment – Applicant reasonably suspected of being involved in people smuggling – Applicant in immigration detention for 10 years – indefinite detention – decision set aide and substituted

### Migration

[De Guzman](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/5097.html)(Migration) [2022] AATA 5097 (7 December 2022); Senior Member R Skaros

MIGRATION – Skilled Work Regional (Provisional) (Class PS) visa – Subclass 491 (Skilled Work Regional (Provisional)) – Registered Nurse (Nec) – skills assessment – timing of assessment – ‘at the time of the invitation to apply for the visa’ – period which invitation was valid or open – decision under review remitted

[Jiang](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/451.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 451 (6 February 2023); M Brophy, Member

MIGRATION – Child (Migrant) (Class AH) visa – Subclass 102 (Adoption) – formal and legal adoption in another country – registration with a relevant competent authority – 12 months residential requirements – review applicant was not residing in China – Adoption Order not a notarised copy – decision under review affirmed

[Bhattarai](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/303.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 303 (9 February 2023); K Malyon, Member

MIGRATION – Regional Employer Nomination (Permanent) (Class RN) visa – Subclass 187 Regional Sponsored Migration Scheme – Direct Entry stream – position of Cook – competent English – English language test in the 3 years prior to visa application – COVID19 pandemic closure of previous employer – lengthy professional experience – successful test result soon after visa application – referral for Ministerial intervention – decision under review affirmed

[El Omar](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/378.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 378 (9 February 2023); M Sripathy, Member

MIGRATION – Partner (Provisional) (Class UF) visa – Subclass 309 (Partner (Provisional)) – Federal Circuit and Family Court remittal – married relationship – religious marriage by proxy after religious divorce of sponsor’s previous marriage and application to FCCA for divorce, but before order granted – not solemnised under Marriage Act, but accepted as demonstration of commitment at the time – later sharia court deed valid – limited household, financial aspects of relationship while living in different countries – COVID restrictions and security situation in home country – duration of relationship and nature of commitment – decision under review remitted

[Chen](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/297.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 297 (11 February 2023); D Barker

IGRATION – Student (Temporary) (Class TU) visa – Subclass 500 (Student) – person associated with proliferation of weapons of mass destruction – PhD student in photonics and optical thermometry – extension of time granted to allow for internal review of DFAT determination – determination not revoked – not appropriate to go behind DFAT determinations or grant further extension of time to allow for second review – no explanation for DFAT determinations – study grant from Australian government – thesis submitted but associated projects in progress – consequences of refusal for future travel for study or work – member of family unit – decision under review affirmed

### National Disability Insurance Scheme

[**Cofre and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/810.html) [2023] AATA 810 (14 April 2023); I Thompson, Member

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – disability accommodation requirements – applicant’s impairments and challenging behaviours – reasonable and necessary supports – decision set aside

[**HDCZ and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/812.html) [2023] AATA 812 (31 March 2023); P Smith, Member

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – Request made to the Tribunal by the Respondent pursuant to Part 5 of the Administrative Appeals Tribunal: General Practice Direction to be granted leave to be released from an implied undertaking the Respondent gave to the Tribunal in respect of three sets of documents in the course of the proceeding – where the Respondent received two sets of documents from the Applicant under compulsion – whether an implied undertaking applies to an expert report that was provided to the Tribunal and the Applicant by the Respondent but not under the compulsory processes of the Tribunal – because the report refers to the two sets of documents that are subject to the implied undertaking – whether leave should be granted to the Respondent so that they may use the documents for the purpose of carrying out their various functions under the National Disability Insurance Scheme Act 2013 (Cth), which may include using the documents at future planning meetings when reassessing reasonable and necessary supports – whether the Respondent intends to use the documents for a collateral or ulterior purpose not connected to the Tribunal proceeding – whether the reasons for the request are mysterious and/or vague and whether the request fails to give substantial reasons – whether the request should be refused on the basis that the documents contain health and personal details about the Applicant – whether special circumstances exist – whether the legal representative for the Respondent and their expert witness breached the implied undertaking – public interest – leave to be released from the implied undertaking granted

[**Kelly and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/776.html) [2023] AATA 776 (17 April 2023); Senior Member Dr S Fenwick

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – access to scheme – spinal condition – referred and chronic pain – whether the impairments are, or are likely to be, permanent –consideration of the prospects of surgical intervention to remedy the impairment – access criteria not met – decision affirmed

[**QKNJ and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/794.html) [2023] AATA 794 (12 April 2023); Senior Member P J Clauson AM

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – SDA accommodation – suitable SDA building type – reasonable and necessary supports – appropriate SDA housing category – SDA Rules – sufficient weight given to applicant submissions – application of the SDA Price Guide – Tribunal jurisdiction to review funding under SDA Price Guide

[**XNTW and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/759.html) [2023] AATA 759 (14 April 2023); Senior Member D O'Donovan

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – reasonable and necessary supports – dyslexia – dyscalculia – whether NDIA should fund services in numeracy and literacy – NDIA is not the appropriate source of funding or provision – decision under review affirmed

### Practice and Procedure

[**BCNW and Child Support Registrar**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/768.html) (Child support second review) [2023] AATA 768 (14 April 2023); L Benjamin, Member

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE – application for extension of time – power of Tribunal to dismiss an application under subsection 42A(2) – application dismissed by reason of the applicant’s failure to appear at an interlocutory hearing

[**Chiswell and Australian Capital Territory**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/855.html) (Compensation) [2023] AATA 855 (21 April 2023); Senior Member O'Donovan

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE – application to be joined as a party – whether the joinder applicant has interests in the decision under review – whether Tribunal's discretion should be exercised to join joinder application as a party to the proceeding – application to be joined as a party refused

[**McGuinty and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/756.html) [2023] AATA 756 (30 March 2023); Deputy President Mischin

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE – NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – Application for review of decision – application lodged out of time – application for extension of time to lodge application for review – whether ‘reasonable in all the circumstances’ to extend time – application refused

[**13Homecare and National Disability Insurance Agency**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/793.html) [2023] AATA 793 (4 April 2023); D Connolly, Senior Member

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE – Applicant is a registered NDIS provider – Applicant provided services to a participant who is now deceased – Applicant has sought reimbursement for unpaid invoices – Applicant seeks review of the Agency’s decision –no applicable internal review decision – application dismissed under section 42A(4)

[**Thomas and Tax Practitioners Board**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/757.html) [2023] AATA 757 (14 April 2023); Senior Member G Lazanas

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE – application for stay of decisions – termination of tax agent registrations and imposition of four-year bans – whether stays should be granted pending decisions on applications for review – factors relevant to the granting of a stay – poor prospects of success and public interest considerations paramount – misleading statements to Board – stay applications refused

### Refugee

[1715163](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2020/6218.html) (Refugee) [2020] AATA 6218 (7 May 2020); A Murphy, Member

REFUGEE – Subclass 790 (Safe Haven Enterprise) visa – Sri Lanka – Tamil ethnicity – Catholic religion – fears harm from the Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (LTTE), Sri Lanka’s Special Task Force (STF), Tamil Makkal Viduthalai Pulival (TMVP), the Karuna Group, the Sir Lankan authorities and Muslim extremists – actual or imputed political opinion arising from past employment with Sri Lankan police force – residence in an area formerly controlled by Liberation Tigers of Tamil Eelam (LTTE) – former employment with a non-government organisation (NGO) in Sri Lanka – membership of a particular social group – wealthy Tamils in Sri Lanka – failed Tamil asylum seekers who departed Sri Lanka illegally – media reports published relating to the applicant’s illegal departure by boat – decision under review remitted

[1724639](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/5154.html) (Refugee) [2022] AATA 5154 (3 March 2022); D Creedon, Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – United States of America – born in third country to mother from that country and father from USA – US citizen by descent and not eligible for citizenship of birth country – father abandoned applicant and mother at young age – mother’s physical and mental health – applicant cared for by grand-mother in birth country then aunt in Australia – application for orphan relative visa unsuccessful – father now dead and no other relatives willing or able to care for applicant – family, education and integration into community – no claim of persecution or well-founded fear – complementary protection – risk of irreparable harm and best interests of child – decision under review remitted

[1709985](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/5089.html) (Refugee) [2022] AATA 5089 (18 November 2022); D McCulloch, Member

REFUGEE – Protection Visa – Nepal – Hindu faith – actual and imputed political opinion – a member of a particular social group – single women who have had children outside of marriage – an honest and credible witness – societal mistreatment and discrimination directed towards unmarried single mothers – decision under review remitted

[1924119](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/5058.html) (Refugee) [2022] AATA 5058 (8 December 2022); S Hoffman, Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Kenya – Federal Circuit Court remittal – particular social group – former gang member – fear of gang revenge – fear of killing – police targeting gang members – orders to arrest – election violence – attack on family home – decision under review affirmed

[1910818](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/5060.html) (Refugee) [2022] AATA 5060 (13 December 2022); Senior Member J Pennell

REFUGEE – protection visa – Iran – Federal Circuit Court remittal – religion – conversion to Christianity – apostasy charges – imputed political opinion – satellite dish supply – arrest for drinking alcohol – arrests – physical assault – failed asylum seeker – exit from Iran – decision under review affirmed

[1721008](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/5050.html) (Refugee) [2022] AATA 5050 (14 December 2022); K Chapple, Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Indonesia – race – ethnic Chinese – political opinion – historic anti-Chinese riots – fear of ethnic violence – perceived as wealthy – state protection – decision under review affirmed

[1730513](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/5093.html) (Refugee) [2022] AATA 5093 (20 December 2022); C Packer, Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Malaysia – particular social group – LGB persons in Malaysia – lesbian identity – relationship and marriage with a transgender man – same sex marriage in Australia – fear of physical harassment and ill treatment – denial of capacity to earn a livelihood – state protection – decision under review remitted

[2212166](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/678.html) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 678 (3 January 2023); Senior Member D James

REFUGEE – protection visa – Burundi – mixed Hutu-Tutsi ethnicity – 1993 Burundi civil war – fear of harm from people who filled his family – imputed political opinion – anti-government – particular social group – civil war returnee – rich westerner – Australian criminal conviction and imprisonment – psychological harm – decision under review affirmed

[1924221](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/477.html) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 477 (13 January 2023); Senior Member K Harvey

REFUGEE – protection visa – Venezuela – political opinion – opposition to the Government’s education agenda – Tascón list – harassed by the Circulos Bolivarianos and colectivos – Maisanta program – employment opportunities – Carnet de la Patria – ability to subsist – decision under review remitted

### Social Security

[**Bunker and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/728.html) (Social services second review) [2023] AATA 728 (11 April 2023); Senior Member B Cullen

SOCIAL SECURITY – whether applicant qualifies for disability support pension – whether conditions fully diagnosed, treated and stabilised during the qualification period – whether impairments were of 20 points or more under s 94(1)(b) – decision affirmed

[**Harvey and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/758.html) (Social services second review) [2023] AATA 758 (14 April 2023); Senior Member A Poljak

SOCIAL SECURITY – disability support pension (DSP) application – whether the applicant qualified for the DSP during the relevant qualification period – back condition – mental health conditions – whether the applicant has a physical, mental or psychiatric impairment – whether the applicant’s disabilities may be assigned a relevant impairment rating – whether the applicant has a continuing inability to work or is participating in a relevant program of support – applicant’s conditions not able to be assigned impairment ratings – decision under review affirmed

[**Khan and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/774.html)v (Social services second review) [2023] AATA 774 (17 April 2023); B J Illingworth, Senior Member

Social Security – Special Benefit – Newley Arrived Resident’s Waiting Period – Exemption for Newley Arrived Resident’s Waiting Period – Substantial change of circumstances beyond Applicant’s control – Point in Time

### Taxation

[**Elcheikh and Commissioner of Taxation**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/859.html) (Taxation) [2023] AATA 859 (21 April 2023); D Mitchell, Member

TAXATION – income tax – default amended assessments – whether evasion – unexplained bank deposits – onus to prove assessments were excessive and what taxable income should have been – administrative penalty – whether intentional disregard – whether administrative penalty should be remitted – whether shortfall interest charge should be remitted – decision under review affirmed

[**Messenger Media and Information Technology Pty Ltd and Commissioner of Taxation**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/752.html) (Taxation) [2023] AATA 752 (27 March 2023); Senior Member Dr L Kirk

TAXATION – goods and services tax – eligibility to claim input tax credits – 4 year time limit in section 105-55 of Schedule 1 to the Tax Administration Act 1953 (Cth) – whether reviewable GST decision – decision under review affirmed

# Appeals

This section of the Bulletin provides information about appeals that have been lodged or finalised against decisions in the AAT’s General, Freedom of Information, National Disability Insurance Scheme, Security, Small Business Taxation, Taxation & Commercial and Veterans’ Appeals Divisions. Information is only included about appeals relating to AAT decisions that have been published on [AustLII](http://www.austlii.edu.au/au/cases/cth/aat/). Full copies of the decisions can be accessed through the hyperlinks provided below.

### Appeals lodged

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| CASE NAME | AAT reference |
| **Afamiliona and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2023] AATA 131](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/131.html) |
| **Bui and Minister for Immigration and Border Protection** | [[2017] AATA 1330](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2017/1330.html) |
| **LYYZ and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs** | [**[2020] AATA 1635**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2020/1635.html) |
| **VZWF and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2021] AATA 1876](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2021/1876.html) |

### Appeals finalised

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| CASE NAME | AAT reference | court Reference |
| **Climo v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2022] AATA 38](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/38.html) | [[2023] FCA 338](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCA/2023/338.html) |
| **Kwatra v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2021] AATA 3147](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2021/3147.html) | [**[2023] HCASL 64**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/HCASL/2023/64.html)[**[2022] FCA 680**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCA/2022/680.html)[**[2022] FCAFC 194**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCAFC/2022/194.html) |
| **Luck v Secretary of Services Australia & Ors** | [**[2010] AATA 6**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2010/6.html) | [**[2023] HCASL 62**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/HCASL/2023/62.html)[**[2016] FCA 950**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCA/2016/950.html)[**[2022] FCAFC 195**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCAFC/2022/195.html) |
| **WFFJ v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2022] AATA 262](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/2626.html) | [[2023] FCA 335](http://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCA/2023/335.html) |

© Commonwealth of Australia 2022


With the exception of the Commonwealth Coat of Arms and any third-party material, this work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia Licence](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/au/deed.en). Content from this publication should be attributed as: Administrative Appeals Tribunal, *AAT Bulletin*.

To the extent that copyright subsists in third party material, it remains with the original owner and permission may be required to reuse the material.

The terms under which the Coat of Arms can be used are detailed on the following website: <https://www.pmc.gov.au/government/commonwealth-coat-arms>.

Enquiries regarding the licence are welcome at **aatweb@aat.gov.au**.

This licence is limited to the *AAT Bulletin* and does not extend to the full text of AAT decisions. Separate licence terms for AAT decisions can be found on [**AustLII**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/au/cases/cth/aat/).