

AAT Bulletin

Issue No. 07/2024 08 April 2024

The *AAT Bulletin* is a fortnightly publication containing information about recently published decisions and appeals against decisions in the AAT’s General, Freedom of Information, National Disability Insurance Scheme, Security, Small Business Taxation, Taxation & Commercial and Veterans’ Appeals Divisions. The Bulletin also regularly includes a sample of decisions recently published in the AAT’s Migration & Refugee Division and Social Services & Child Support Division. It occasionally includes information on legislative changes that affect the AAT.

It is recommended that the Bulletin be read online. This has the advantage of allowing the reader to use hyperlinks to access the full text of cases and other internet sites mentioned in the Bulletin.

The AAT does not make any representation or warranty about the accuracy, reliability, currency or completeness of any material contained in this Bulletin or on any linked site. While the AAT makes every effort to ensure that the material in the Bulletin is accurate and up-to-date, you should exercise your own independent skill and judgement before you rely on it. Information contained in this Bulletin is not legal advice and is intended as a general guide only. You should rely on your own advice or refer to the full cases and legislation in relation to any proceedings.

Contents

[AAT Recent Decisions 3](#_Toc163480189)

[Child Support 3](#_Toc163480190)

[Citizenship 4](#_Toc163480191)

[Compensation 4](#_Toc163480192)

[Freedom of Information 4](#_Toc163480193)

[Migration 5](#_Toc163480194)

[National Disability Insurance Scheme 6](#_Toc163480195)

[Practice and Procedure 7](#_Toc163480196)

[Professions and Trades 8](#_Toc163480197)

[Refugee 8](#_Toc163480198)

[Social Security 10](#_Toc163480199)

[Taxation 11](#_Toc163480200)

[Veterans’ Affairs 11](#_Toc163480201)

[Appeals 12](#_Toc163480202)

[Appeals lodged 12](#_Toc163480203)

[Appeals finalised 12](#_Toc163480204)

# AAT Recent Decisions

This section of the Bulletin provides information about all decisions recently published in the AAT’s General, Freedom of Information, National Disability Insurance Scheme, Security, Small Business Taxation, Taxation & Commercial and Veterans’ Appeals. This list also includes selected child support decisions published by the Social Services & Child Support Division and examples of recent decisions published by the Migration & Refugee Division. Only AAT decisions that have been published on [**AustLII**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/au/cases/cth/aat/) have been included. Full copies of the decisions can be accessed through the hyperlinks provided below.

### Child Support

[**Derricks and Derricks**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/476.html) (Child support) [2024] AATA 476 (6 February 2024); P Jensen, Member

CHILD SUPPORT – non-agency payments – refusal to credit non-agency payments - payments made to third parties and to carer entitled to receive - whether utility payment should be credited – no mutual intention – decision under review affirmed

[**Dowding and Dowding**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/484.html) (Child support) [2024] AATA 484 (8 February 2024); R Ellis, Senior Member

CHILD SUPPORT – departure determination – income, property and financial resources of the liable parent – ground for departure established - hardship - decision under review set aside and substituted

[**Fountaine and Fountaine**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/489.html) (Child support) [2024] AATA 489 (7 February 2024); K Dordevic, Senior Member

CHILD SUPPORT – percentage of care – whether there was a change to the likely pattern of care - child living partly with third party - decision under review affirmed

[**Jolley and Nihill**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/482.html) (Child support) [2024] AATA 482 (12 February 2024); I Sheck, Member

CHILD SUPPORT – percentage of care – whether there was a change to the likely pattern of care – child living away from parents - existing percentage of care determinations revoked and new determinations made – where parents still providing care despite child living away from them - decision under review set aside and substituted

[**McLean and Corddry**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/478.html) (Child support) [2024] AATA 478 (12 February 2024); J Leonard, Member

CHILD SUPPORT – non-agency payments - whether payments made to a third party in lieu of child support – payments made to child – no child support liability at the time of payments – not satisfied mutually intended to be paid as satisfaction of amount under enforceable maintenance liability - decision under review set aside and substituted

### Citizenship

[**Baldry and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/558.html) (Citizenship) [2024] AATA 558 (3 April 2024); A Younes, Deputy President

CITIZENSHIP – Refusal of application for Australian citizenship by conferral – Whether Applicant meets criteria under paragraph 21(2)(g) of the Australian Citizenship Act 2007 (Cth) – Where Applicant’s spouse and children are Australian citizens – Where Applicant has spent limited time in Australia – Where Applicant has no employment or assets in Australia – Whether Applicant is likely to reside in Australia or maintain a close and continuing association with Australia – Decision under review affirmed

[**Perera and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4707.html) (Citizenship) [2023] AATA 4707 (25 March 2023); K Millar, Senior Member

CITIZENSHIP – application for citizenship by conferral – refusal of citizenship – whether applicant meets residence requirements – general residence requirement – did applicant have a close and continuing relationship with Australia in the relevant period – decision under review affirmed

[**Sae-Lim and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/595.html) (Citizenship) [2024] AATA 595 (20 March 2023); A Younes, Deputy President

CITIZENSHIP – application for citizenship by conferral – citizenship application refused – applicant did not attend the scheduled test appointment – whether the applicant has a right to ‘keep on foot’ the application – decision under review affirmed

### Compensation

[**Secretary, Department of Home Affairs and Comcare**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/592.html) (Compensation) [2024] AATA 592 (20 March 2024); W Frost, Member

WORKERS’ COMPENSATION – section 14 of the Safety, Rehabilitation and Compensation Act 1988 – definition of ‘injury’ under subsection 5A(1) SRC Act – definition of ‘disease’ under subsection 5B(1) – disease suffered by an employee – whether a disease was contributed to a significant degree by employment – determining the meaning of ‘significant degree’ in section 5B SRC Act – ‘material contribution’ under section 5B SRC Act – contribution of workplace and employment factors – Department assisted rehabilitation – graduated return to work – Safety, Rehabilitation and Compensation and Other Legislation Amendment Act 2007 (Cth) – psychological condition – adjustment disorder – chronic adjustment disorder – relevance of past psychiatric history – relevance of family psychiatric history – increased alcohol consumption – alcohol use disorder – reliability of witnesses – false or misleading evidence – decision under review set aside

### Freedom of Information

[**Patrick and Secretary, Department of the Treasury**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/545.html) (Freedom of information) [2024] AATA 545 (28 March 2024); P Britten-Jones, Deputy President

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION – s 47C conditional exemption applied to identified document in issue – deliberative processes – public interest test – decision set aside and substituted

### Migration

[**2120175**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/540.html) (Migration) [2024] AATA 540 (8 January 2024); M Martellotta, Member

MIGRATION – Partner (Temporary) (Class UK) visa – Subclass 820 (Partner) – sponsorship limitation requirement – sponsor convicted of a relevant offence – length of the relationship – time since completing the sentence – applicant continued to support the sponsor – no children of the relationship – decision under review remitted

[**Allouch**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4450.html) (Migration) [2023] AATA 4450 (16 November 2023); M Foster, Member

MIGRATION – Other Family (Residence) (Class BU) visa – Subclass 836 (Carer) – carer of an Australian relative – assistance cannot reasonably be provided/obtained – welfare, hospital, nursing or community services – partially dependent for activities of daily living (ADLs) – cultural or religious requirements – Muslim woman – preference rather than religious requirement – cost of obtaining services – decision under review affirmed

[**DPGF and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/556.html) (Migration) [2024] AATA 556 (27 March 2024); S Boyle, Deputy President

MIGRATION – s 501CA(4) of Migration Act – decision not to revoke mandatory cancellation of visa – conviction for serious assaults (choking) against partner – family violence – where the Applicant does not pass the character test – whether there is ‘another reason’ to revoke the cancellation – consideration of Ministerial Direction 99 - protection of the Australian community – links to the Australian community – the best interests of minor children in Australia – expectations of the Australian community – legal consequences of the decision – impediments if removed – extensive rehabilitation – low risk of reoffending – consideration of non-refoulement issues deferred under para 9.1.2(2) of Direction 99 – considerations in favour of revocation of cancellation outweigh those against revocation of cancellation – decision under review set aside and substituted

[**Laohasakprasit**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/141.html) (Migration) [2024] AATA 141 (25 January 2024); M Sripathy, Member

MIGRATION – Child (Migrant) (Class AH) visa – Subclass 102 (Adoption) – overseas adoption – review applicant residing overseas for more than 12 months – visa applicant holds a Student visa – business opportunity in Australia – decision under review affirmed

[**MSVK and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/534.html) (Migration) [2024] AATA 534 (27 March 2024); Emeritus Professor P A Fairall, Senior Member

MIGRATION – Migration Act 1958 (Cth) – non-revocation of mandatory visa cancellation – Direction No.99 – protection of Australian community – family violence – strength, nature and duration of ties to Australia – best interests of minor children – expectations of the Australian community – extent of impediments if removed – where applicant convicted of aggravated kidnapping – where applicant spent formative years in Australia – decision under review set aside

[**Patel**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/152.html) (Migration) [2024] AATA 152 (17 January 2024); P Katsambanis, Member

MIGRATION – Skilled Nominated (Permanent) visa – Subclass 190 (Skilled – Nominated) – occupation of ICT Security Specialist – false and misleading information – claimed relevant employment reference and salary details – pay details supplied by related entity – updated payment summaries – lengthy ongoing employment – decision under review remitted

[**Pham and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship, Migrant Services and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/535.html) (Migration) [2024] AATA 535 (13 March 2024); D O'Donovan, Senior Member

MIGRATION – mandatory cancellation of the applicant’s Class BB Subclass 155 Five Year Resident Return visa – applicant is a citizen of Vietnam – recklessly deal with proceeds of crime – traffic methylamphetamine – drive dangerously – assault officer in execution of duty – family violence – failure to pass character test – whether there is another reason to revoke the cancellation – Direction No 99 – protection of the Australian Community – best interests of minor children – expectations of the Australian community – strength, nature and duration of ties – extent of impediments if removed – decision under review affirmed

[**Te Ohaere and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/550.html) (Migration) AATA 550 (28 March 2024); A George, Senior Member

MIGRATION – cancellation of applicant’s Class TY Subclass 444 Special Category (Temporary) visa – where applicant does not pass the character test – offending serious – repeat offending – consideration of ministerial direction no.99 – decision under review set-aside

**[Vu](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/159.html)** (Migration) [2024] AATA 159 (31 January 2024); G Bartley, Member

MIGRATION – Prospective Marriage (Temporary) (Class TO) visa – Subclass 300 (Prospective Marriage) – genuine intention to marry – known to each other personally – communication about each other’s families – review applicant’s visits to Vietnam – companionship and emotional support – pooled financial resources – joint family events and travel – decision under review remitted

### National Disability Insurance Scheme

[**Isherwood and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/597.html) [2024] AATA 597 (4 April 2024); T Bubutievski, Member

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – access – alcohol induced neurocognitive disorder – liver failure – impairment relied upon for access changed during Tribunal process – permanence – whether substantially reduced functional capacity – decision under review affirmed

[**LJQD and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/564.html) [2024] AATA 564 (2 April 2024); J Collins, Senior Member

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – access criteria – s24(1)(c) – s24(1)(e) – s25 – whether applicant meets disability requirements – whether impairments permanent – whether impairments substantially reduce functional capacity – whether applicant meets early intervention requirements – whether likely to require support under National Disability Insurance Scheme for applicant’s lifetime – whether supports more appropriately funded through another service system – decision under review affirmed

[**Whitington and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/554.html?context=1;query=Whitington%20and%20National%20Disability%20Insurance%20Agency%20;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) [2024] AATA 554 (2 April 2024); J Collins, Senior Member

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – access criteria – s24 NDIS Act – s25 NDIS Act – whether applicant meets disability requirements – whether applicant meets the early intervention requirements – degenerative spine disease, peripheral axonal sensory motor neuropathy, ankylosing spondylitis – bladder dysfunction – likely permanency – whether impairments substantially reduce functional capacity – decision under review affirmed

[**XVYL and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/498.html?context=1;query=XVYL%20and%20National%20Disability%20Insurance%20Agency;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) [2024] AATA 498 (22 March 2024); M Mischin, Deputy President

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – access to scheme – advanced eating disorder – Anorexia Nervosa – impairments arising out of the advanced eating disorder – whether the Applicant meets the access criteria under section 21 of the National Disability Insurance Scheme Act 2013 (Cth) (the NDIS Act) – whether the Applicant’s impairments have resulted in substantially reduced functional capacity to undertake one or more of the activities listed in section 24(1)(c) of the NDIS Act – whether supports required for the Applicant’s lifetime – whether recommended supports are more appropriately funded through general systems of service delivery – whether criteria for early intervention under section 25 of the NDIS Act established – decision under review affirmed

[**ZWXT and National Disability Insurance Agency**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/543.html?context=1;query=ZWXT%20and%20National%20Disability%20Insurance%20Agency%20;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) [2024] AATA 543 (25 March 2024); K Parker, Senior Member

NATIONAL DISABILITY INSURANCE SCHEME – review of supports – child participant – disability arising from impairments caused by genetic condition of Down Syndrome – review of statement of participant supports in Applicant’s NDIS plan – whether request for funding for applied behavioural analysis (ABA) and other supports should be funded under the NDIS – whether supports are “reasonable and necessary supports” under s 34(1) of the National Disability Insurance Scheme Act 2013 (Cth) – whether ABA therapy is likely to be effective and beneficial given age of the Applicant and his genetic condition – whether ABA is a duplication of other therapeutic interventions – decision set aside and remitted with a direction that a new statement of participant supports is to be approved for the Applicant containing additional supports

### Practice and Procedure

[**Kondylas and Comcare**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/553.html?context=1;query=Kondylas%20and%20Comcare%20;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Compensation) [2024] AATA 553 (28 March 2024); B J Illingworth, Senior Member

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE – interlocutory application pursuant to section 42B(1)(c) of the Administrative Appeals Tribunal Act 1975 to dismiss application for review as an abuse of process – whether failure to take into account duty at sea allowance in the normal weekly earnings (NWE) calculation in a reconsideration on own motion enlivened a review right – NWE previously the subject of a reconsideration and related section 42C(1) decision excluding Duty at Sea Allowance from the calculation – workers’ compensation – application for review dismissed

[**Manton; Secretary, Department of Social Services and**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/593.html) (Social services second review) [2024] AATA 593 (3 April 2024); K Parker, Senior Member

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE – stay application – decision under review relates to debt raised against the Respondent arising from overpayment of youth allowance under the Social Security Act 1991 (Cth) – decision under review set aside and remitted to the Applicant for reconsideration – Respondent seeks review of decision under review and challenges approach directed by the Social Services & Child Support Division of the Tribunal by which to recalculate the debt – complex legal issues arising – cohort of similar applications – one application from cohort will be heard as a ‘test application’ before three members of the General Division of the Tribunal – Respondent has partially repaid the debt – Applicant concerned about returning the partial payment to the Respondent in the event this amount will need to be recovered at a later time – Applicant undertook not to seek recovery in the interim from the Respondent of the remaining portion of the debt – Respondent keen to have these issues finally resolved and has experienced distress as a result of debt collection activities relating to the debt – request for the stay opposed by the Respondent – Tribunal satisfied that the balance of convenience weighs in favour of the Applicant – stay order granted

[**Serageldin Abbas Abdelrahman and Minister for Health and Aged Care**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/555.html?context=1;query=Serageldin%20Abbas%20Abdelrahman%20and%20Minister%20for%20Health%20and%20Aged%20Care%20;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) [2024] AATA 555 (2 April 2024); Emeritus Professor P A Fairall, Senior Member

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE – summons to produce documents – application to have summons set aside – whether summonsed documents relevant to substantive issues – nature of discretion to grant exemption under Health Insurance (Section 19AB Exemptions Guidelines) Determination 2019 – summons set aside

### Professions and Trades

[**Matai and Australian Securities and Investments Commission**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/520.html?context=1;query=Matai%20and%20Australian%20Securities%20and%20Investments%20Commission%20;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) [2024] AATA 520 (21 March 2024); I R Molloy, Deputy President

FINANCIAL SERVICES – banning order – where Applicant had failed to comply with financial services laws and not adequately trained to provide financial advice – where conduct related to Applicant’s provision of personal financial advice – where conduct had resulted in loss to clients – whether banning period of four years appropriate – decision affirmed

### Refugee

[**1721863**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4495.html?context=1;query=1721863;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 4495 (17 October 2023); J Lambie, Senior Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Sri Lanka – review of 785 Temporary Protection Visa – Tamil males from the Vanni suspected of being part of the LTTE – failed Tamil asylum seekers – successful Tamil businessmen – operated money lending business – lent money to landlady – landlady’s refusal to repay loan – landlady’s connection with high ranking officer in Sri Lankan military – applicants subsequently accused of being LTTE – asked to report to CID – inconsistencies in evidence – decision under review affirmed

[**1820585**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4521.html?context=1;query=1820585;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 4521 (17 October 2023); P Haag, Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Sierra Leone – imputed political opinion – anti Sierra Leone People's Party (SLPP) – threatened and assaulted by relative over land title – father murdered – credibility issues – decision under review affirmed

[**1837741**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4587.html?context=1;query=1837741;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 4587 (29 November 2023); S Roushan, Senior Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Vietnam – Unauthorised Maritime Arrival (UMA) status – ‘fast track’ applicant status – Part 7 reviewable decision – statutory bar in s 91K and the s 48A bar – application deemed invalid – grounds for reopening a decision – earlier decision treated as a nullity – political opinion – member of the Vietnam Reform Revolutionary Party (Viet Tan) – outspoken critic of the Vietnamese authorities – decision under review remitted

[**1909307**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4469.html) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 4469 (6 October 2023); K Chapple, Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Bangladesh – race – Rohingya – nationality – stateless – particular social group – failed asylum seeker – religion – Muslim – Bangladeshi citizenship – Bangladeshi passport fraudulently obtained – financial insecurity – refugee camps – repatriation to Myanmar – decision under review remitted

[**1916742**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4497.html?context=1;query=1916742;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 4497 (17 October 2023); M Sripathy, Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Iran – Christian convert – hostile ex-husband in Iran – recent history of anti-government political protest – social media posts about activities – photo of applicant without hijab – cumulative profile – higher risk of serious mistreatment – decision under review remitted

[**2008629**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4437.html) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 4437 (9 October 2023); M O'Loughlin, Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Albania – fear of harm from neighbour after father’s land/house dispute – neighbour’s gang and political connections, and inaction by police – offer to sell land and threats and assault by neighbour’s son while living in third country – residency in third country ceased – mental health and treatment – availability and standards of treatment and societal attitudes in home country – country information – credibility – delay in applying for protection – possibility of yielding land as family not using it – mental health will improve when land dispute settled – member of family unit – second applicant partner citizen of third country – late claim in own right – mental health – submissions by representative do not address claim – unfavourable inference drawn – decision under review affirmed

[**2102207**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4722.html?context=1;query=2102207;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 4722 (10 November 2023); A Duffield, Senior Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Sudan – imputed political opinion – Justice and Equality Party activist family – Darfuri Movement – race – Salamat tribe – Darfuri – particular social group – returnee from the West – failed asylum seeker – detention – physical assault – inter-ethnic conflict – decision under review remitted

[**2302701**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4505.html?context=1;query=2302701;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Refugee) [2023] AATA 4505 (18 October 2023); M McAdam, Member

REFUGEE – protection visa – Libya – Federal Circuit and Family Court remittal – ethnicity and imputed political opinion – tribe known as Gaddafi loyalists, and relatives worked for regime or army – fear of harm by militias – relatives killed or detained – one return to check family during quiet period of conflict – membership of particular social group – homosexual man – claim not included in application but made shortly before departmental interview – discreet general activities and relationships – supporting statements and oral evidence expressing genuine concern – mental health and treatment – practicing Muslim – country information – criminalisation and political, religious and societal attitudes – real chance of harm heightened by tribal identity and imputed political opinion – decision under review remitted

### Social Security

[**Adams and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/546.html) (Social services second review) [2024] AATA 546 (28 March 2024); B Pola, Senior Member

SOCIAL SERVICES – Eligibility for Disability Support Pension – Appeal of decision of Social Services and Child Support Division – where purported impairments related to spinal condition – where competing evidence exists with respect to whether condition is fully diagnosed – where Tribunal considered report from Health Professional Advisory Unit – condition not fully diagnosed – section 94(1)(b) of Social Security Act 1991 (Cth) not satisfied – decision affirmed

[**Agueci and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/552.html?context=1;query=Agueci%20and%20Secretary,%20Department%20of%20Social%20Services;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Social services second review) [2024] AATA 552 (2 April 2024); S Evans, Member

AGE PENSION – rate at which Applicant’s age pension should be paid – whether ‘member of a couple’ for the purposes of s 4(2) of Social Security Act 1991 – application of criteria for forming opinion about relationship s 4(3) – whether special reason Applicant is not to be treated as a member of a couple s 24(2) – decision set aside and remitted for redetermination

[**Kingswood and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/551.html?context=1;query=Kingswood%20and%20Secretary,%20Department%20of%20Social%20Services%20;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Social Services Second Review) [2024] AATA 551 (26 March 2024); Brigadier A G Warner, AM LVO (Retd), Member

SOCIAL SECURITY – disability support pension – qualification period – whether Applicant’s conditions were fully diagnosed, fully treated and fully stabilised at the qualification period – whether Applicant’s impairments attract 20 points under Impairment Tables – decision under review affirmed

[**Lim and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/594.html?context=1;query=Lim%20and%20Secretary,%20Department%20of%20Social%20Services%20;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Social services second review) [2024] AATA 594 (4 April 2024); B Pola, Senior Member

SOCIAL SERVICES – Eligibility for Disability Support Pension – Appeal of decision of Social Services and Child Support Division – where impairments related to spinal condition – where treatment processes and specialist intervention post-dates Qualification Period – section 94(1)(b) of Social Security Act 1991 (Cth) not satisfied – decision affirmed

[**McFadzean and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/536.html?context=1;query=McFadzean%20and%20Secretary,%20Department%20of%20Social%20Services%20;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Social services second review) [2024] AATA 536 (27 March 2024); D Mitchell, Member

SOCIAL SECURITY – disability support pension – DSP – whether medical conditions are fully diagnosed, fully treated and fully stabilised – whether 20 points or more under the impairment tables during the relevant period – decision under review affirmed

[**Sharpe and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/565.html?context=1;query=Sharpe%20and%20Secretary,%20Department%20of%20Social%20Services%20;mask_path=au/cases/cth/AATA) (Social services second review) [2024] AATA 565 (3 April 2024); L M Gallagher, Member

SOCIAL SECURITY – disability support pension, whether applicant’s claimed conditions were fully diagnosed, fully treated and fully stabilised – whether Applicant’s impairments attracted an impairment rating under the Social Security (Tables for the assessment of Work-related Impairment for Disability Support Pension) Determination 2011 – decision under review affirmed

[**Singh and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4752.html) (Social services second review) [2023] AATA 4752 (25 October 2023); A Poljak, Senior Member

SOCIAL SECURITY – Austudy Debt – overpayment – not studying full time – insufficient study workload – whether recovery of debt should be written off or waived – where no administrative error – where no special circumstances – decision under review affirmed

[**Trzaskowski and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/557.html) (Social services second review) [2024] AATA 557 (2 April 2024); Brigadier A G Warner, AM LVO (Retd), Member

SOCIAL SECURITY – disability support pension – whether Applicant’s conditions were fully diagnosed, treated and stabilised during the qualification period – whether Applicant’s conditions attracted an impairment rating of at least 20 points – NZ Agreement – severe disability – whether Applicant qualifies for DSP under NZ Agreement – reviewable decision affirmed

[**Warry and Secretary, Department of Social Services**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/500.html) (Social services second review) [2024] AATA 500 (25 March 2024); D Mitchell, Member

SOCIAL SECURITY – Compensation Recovery – compensation lump sum – lump sum preclusion period – whether special circumstances exist – no evidence that special circumstances exist – compensation charge – no evidence to support write off or waiver – cancellation of disability support pension – decisions under review affirmed

### Taxation

[**WYVW and Commissioner of Taxation**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/4242.html) (Taxation) [2023] AATA 4242 (21 December 2023); D K Grigg, Senior Member

TAX – review under Part IVC of the Taxation Administration Act 1953 (Cth) – default assessments – whether “all or nothing” approach applies – whether deposits income, proceeds of loan or capital payments – whether interest expenses deductible – onus of proof – Jones v Dunkel inferences – whether fraud or evasion – whether intentional disregard, recklessness or lack of reasonable care – whether base penalty uplift applies – whether penalties should be remitted – shortfall interest charge – decisions varied

### Veterans’ Affairs

[**Guild and Repatriation Commission**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/523.html) (Veterans’ entitlements) [2024] AATA 523 (26 March 2024); Emeritus Professor P A Fairall, Senior Member

VETERANS’ AFFAIRS – veterans’ entitlements – pension – Statements of Principles (SoPs) – applicant claimed hypertension and cerebral small vessel disease with ataxia are war-caused – applicant claimed hypertension caused by increased salt and alcohol intake during service – whether earlier claim for ataxia finally determined – where no SoP for ataxia – whether reasonable hypothesis – whether Tribunal satisfied beyond reasonable doubt that there no sufficient ground for making determination – claimed diseases not war-caused – decision under review affirmed

# Appeals

This section of the Bulletin provides information about appeals that have been lodged or finalised against decisions in the AAT’s General, Freedom of Information, National Disability Insurance Scheme, Security, Small Business Taxation, Taxation & Commercial and Veterans’ Appeals Divisions. Information is only included about appeals relating to AAT decisions that have been published on [AustLII](http://www.austlii.edu.au/au/cases/cth/aat/). Full copies of the decisions can be accessed through the hyperlinks provided below.

### Appeals lodged

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| CASE NAME | AAT reference |
| **Gent and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2024] AATA 185](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/185.html?context=1;query=karena%20gent;mask_path=) |
| **Muller and Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2024] AATA 224](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/224.html?context=1;query=%5b2024%5d%20AATA%20224;mask_path=) |
| **Sutherland and National Disability Insurance Agency** | [**[2024] AATA 411**](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/411.html?context=1;query=%5b2024%5d%20AATA%20411;mask_path=) |
| **Quy and Commissioner of Taxation** | [[2024] AATA 245](http://www8.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2024/245.html?context=1;query=%5b2024%5d%20AATA%20245;mask_path=) |

### Appeals finalised

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| CASE NAME | AAT reference | court Reference |
| **HSCK v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2023] AATA 3095](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/3095.html?context=1;query=%5b2023%5d%20AATA%203095;mask_path=) | [[2024] FCA 313](http://www8.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCA/2024/313.html?context=1;query=hsck;mask_path=) |
| **Kim v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2023] AATA 3212](http://www8.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/3212.html) | [[2024] FCA 294](http://www8.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCA/2024/294.html) |
| **Pacific National Services Pty Ltd v Tsoumbris** | [[2022] AATA 3249](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2022/3249.html?context=1;query=tsoumbris;mask_path=) | [[2024] FCA 324](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCA/2024/324.html?context=1;query=tsoumbris;mask_path=) |
| **WVJB v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs** | [[2023] AATA 1388](http://www8.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/1388.html?context=1;query=WVJB;mask_path=) | [[2024] FCA 320](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCA/2024/320.html) |
| **YQLH v Minister for Immigration, Citizenship and Multicultural Affairs & Anor** | [[2023] AATA 2216](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/AATA/2023/2216.html?context=1;query=%5b2023%5d%20AATA%202216;mask_path=) | [[2024] FCA 293](https://www.austlii.edu.au/cgi-bin/viewdoc/au/cases/cth/FCA/2024/293.html?context=1;query=%5b2024%5d%20FCA%20293;mask_path=) |

© Commonwealth of Australia 2024

[Description: Description: Creative Commons License](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/)  
With the exception of the Commonwealth Coat of Arms and any third-party material, this work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia Licence](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/au/deed.en). Content from this publication should be attributed as: Administrative Appeals Tribunal, *AAT Bulletin*.

To the extent that copyright subsists in third party material, it remains with the original owner and permission may be required to reuse the material.

The terms under which the Coat of Arms can be used are detailed on the following website: <https://www.pmc.gov.au/government/commonwealth-coat-arms>.

Enquiries regarding the licence are welcome at [**aatweb@aat.gov.au**](mailto:aatweb@aat.gov.au).

This licence is limited to the *AAT Bulletin* and does not extend to the full text of AAT decisions. Separate licence terms for AAT decisions can be found on [**AustLII**](http://www.austlii.edu.au/au/cases/cth/aat/).